

#-Rewriting Systems and An Infinite Hierarchy Resulting from Them

Based upon

Křivka, Z., Meduna, A., Schönecker, R.:
Generation of Languages by Rewriting Systems that
Resemble Automata,
In: *IJFCS* Vol. 17, No. 5, 2006



meduna@fit.vutbr.cz

Brno University of Technology, Czech Republic

Contents

- 1. Concepts**
- 2. Definition**
- 3. Main Result: An Infinite Hierarchy**
- 4. Open Problem Areas**

#-Rewriting Systems in Formal Language Theory

- Language-defining models
- Pure rewriting systems
- Between automata and grammars:
have states but generate languages

Concept

#-Rewriting System is based on the rules of the form

$$p_{\textcolor{brown}{m}} \# \rightarrow q \ x_0 \# x_1 \dots \# x_n$$

by which the system makes a computational
step \Rightarrow as

$$\begin{array}{c}
 \textcolor{brown}{m}^{\text{th}} \# \\
 \downarrow \\
 (\textcolor{blue}{p}, \dots \# y_{m-1} \# \textcolor{red}{y}_m \# y_{m+1} \dots) \Rightarrow \\
 (\textcolor{blue}{q}, \dots \# y_{m-1} x_0 \# x_1 \dots \# \textcolor{violet}{x}_n y_m \# y_{m+1} \dots)
 \end{array}$$

Definition 1/2

#-Rewriting System (#RS) is a quadruple

$$H = (Q, \Sigma, s, R), \text{ where}$$

- Q —finite set of *states*,
- Σ —*alphabet*, $\# \in \Sigma$ is called a *bounder*,
- $s \in Q$ —*start state*,
- R —*finite set of rules* of the form

$$\mathbf{p}_{\color{orange}m} \# \rightarrow \mathbf{q} \mathbf{x}$$

where $\mathbf{p}, \mathbf{q} \in Q$, $\color{orange}m$ is a positive integer, $\mathbf{x} \in \Sigma^*$.

Definition 2/2

Configuration: (q, x) , $q \in Q, x \in \Sigma^*$

Computational step:

$(p, u\#v) \Rightarrow (q, uxv)$ [$p_m \# \rightarrow qx \in R$],

where the number of $\#$ s in u is $m - 1$,

$p, q \in Q, u, x, v \in \Sigma^*$.

Generated language:

$L(H) = \{w \in (\Sigma - \#)^*: (s, \#) \Rightarrow^* (q, w) \text{ in } H, q \in Q\}$.

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

[1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$

[2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$

[3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$

[4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$

[5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{l} (s, \#) \\ \Rightarrow \end{array}$$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} (s, \#) & & [1] \\ \Rightarrow & & \end{array}$$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{aligned} & (s, \#) \\ \Rightarrow & (p, \#\#) \quad [1] \\ \Rightarrow & \end{aligned}$$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{aligned} & (s, \#) \\ \Rightarrow & (p, \underline{\#}\#) \quad [1] \\ \Rightarrow & \quad \quad \quad [2] \end{aligned}$$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- \Rightarrow

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- \Rightarrow [3]

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#) \quad [1]$
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#) \quad [2]$
- $\Rightarrow (p, a\#bc\#) \quad [3]$
- \Rightarrow

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow p \ \# \#$
- [2]. $p \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow q \ a \# b$
- [3]. $q \underset{2}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow p \ \# c$
- [4]. $p \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \# \#) \quad [1]$
- $\Rightarrow (q, a \# b \#) \quad [2]$
- $\Rightarrow (p, a \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} b c \#) \quad [3]$
- $\Rightarrow \quad [4]$

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- $\Rightarrow (p, a\#bc\#)$ [3]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc\#)$ [4]
- \Rightarrow

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- $\Rightarrow (p, a\#bc\#)$ [3]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc\#)$ [4]
- \Rightarrow [5]

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- $\Rightarrow (p, a\#bc\#)$ [3]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc\#)$ [4]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc)$ [5]

Example: $\#RS$

$\#RS\ H:$

- [1]. $s \ 1\# \rightarrow p \ \#\#$
- [2]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow q \ a\#b$
- [3]. $q \ 2\# \rightarrow p \ \#c$
- [4]. $p \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ ab$
- [5]. $f \ 1\# \rightarrow f \ c$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \#\#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a\#b\#)$ [2]
- $\Rightarrow (p, a\#bc\#)$ [3]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc\#)$ [4]
- $\Rightarrow (f, aabbcc)$ [5]

$$L(H) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\}$$

Finite index of $\#RS$

$\#$ -Rewriting systems of *index k*:

\Rightarrow over configurations with k or fewer $\#$ s

$\#RS_k$ – the language family generated by
 $\#RS$ s of index k

Example: Index $k = 2$:

1. $(p, a\#a\#b) \Rightarrow (q, aa\#aa\#b)$ [$p_1\# \rightarrow qa\#a \in R$]

OK

2. $(p, a\#a\#b) \not\Rightarrow (q, a\#aa##bb)$ [$p_2\# \rightarrow qa##b \in R$]

INCORRECT

Example: $\#RS$ of finite index

$\#RS H$:

- [1]. $s \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{s}} \# \rightarrow p \underset{1}{\textcolor{red}{\#}} \# \#$
- [2]. $p \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{p}} \# \rightarrow q \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{a}} \# b$
- [3]. $q \underset{2}{\textcolor{blue}{q}} \# \rightarrow p \underset{2}{\textcolor{red}{\#}} c$
- [4]. $p \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{p}} \# \rightarrow f \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{a}} b$
- [5]. $f \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{f}} \# \rightarrow f \underset{1}{\textcolor{blue}{c}}$

H accepts $aabbcc$:

- $(s, \#)$
- $\Rightarrow (p, \# \#)$ [1]
- $\Rightarrow (q, a \# b \#)$ [2]
- $\Rightarrow (p, a \# b c \#)$ [3]
- $\Rightarrow (f, a a b b c \#)$ [4]
- $\Rightarrow (f, a a b b c c)$ [5]

H is of index 2.

$$L(H) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\} \in \#RS_2$$

Main Result: An Infinite Hierarchy

Theorem: $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$, for all $k \geq 1$.

Proof:

makes use of programmed grammars (*PG*) of index k

Proof: Programmed Grammars

Programmed Grammar (PG) is a modification of context-free grammar based on the rules of the form:

$$\textcolor{orange}{r}: A \rightarrow \textcolor{magenta}{x}, \textcolor{blue}{W}_{\textcolor{orange}{r}}$$

- $\textcolor{orange}{r}: A \rightarrow \textcolor{magenta}{x}$ is a context-free rule labeled by $\textcolor{orange}{r}$,
- $\textcolor{blue}{W}_{\textcolor{orange}{r}}$ —finite set of rule labels

Derivation step (\Rightarrow):

after the application of rule $\textcolor{orange}{r}$,
a rule from $\textcolor{blue}{W}_{\textcolor{orange}{r}}$ has to be applied

Proof: Finite index of PG

Programmed grammars of *index k*:

- \Rightarrow over sentential forms with k or fewer occurrences of nonterminals.

P_k – the language family defined by programmed grammars of index k

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

S

\Rightarrow

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$S \Rightarrow [1]$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $\textcolor{red}{S} \rightarrow ABC, \{\textcolor{blue}{2}, \textcolor{blue}{5}\}$

2: $\textcolor{orange}{A} \rightarrow aA, \{\textcolor{blue}{3}\}$

3: $\textcolor{red}{B} \rightarrow bB, \{\textcolor{blue}{4}\}$

4: $\textcolor{red}{C} \rightarrow cC, \{\textcolor{blue}{2}, \textcolor{blue}{5}\}$

5: $\textcolor{orange}{A} \rightarrow a, \{\textcolor{blue}{6}\}$

6: $\textcolor{red}{B} \rightarrow b, \{\textcolor{blue}{7}\}$

7: $\textcolor{red}{C} \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{l} \textcolor{red}{S} \\ \Rightarrow \textcolor{orange}{A}BC \quad [1] \\ \Rightarrow \end{array}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{l}
 S \\
 \Rightarrow ABC \quad [1] \\
 \Rightarrow \\
 \Rightarrow
 \end{array}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{ll} S & \\ \Rightarrow ABC & [1] \\ \Rightarrow aABC & [2] \\ \Rightarrow & \end{array}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{array}{ll} S & \\ \Rightarrow ABC & [1] \\ \Rightarrow aABC & [2] \\ \Rightarrow & [3] \end{array}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBc & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow &
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBc & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow &
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$

2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$

3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$

4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$

5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$

6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$

7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

S

$\Rightarrow ABC [1]$

$\Rightarrow aABC [2]$

$\Rightarrow aAbBC [3]$

$\Rightarrow aAbBcC [4]$

\Rightarrow

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

$$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC \quad [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC \quad [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBC \quad [3] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBcC \quad [4] \\
 \Rightarrow & \quad [5]
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

- $$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBC & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBcC & [4] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabBcC & [5] \\
 \Rightarrow &
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

- $$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBC & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBcC & [4] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabBcC & [5] \\
 \Rightarrow &
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

- $$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBC & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBcC & [4] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabBcC & [5] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabbcC & [6] \\
 \Rightarrow &
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

- $$\begin{aligned}
 & S \\
 \Rightarrow & ABC & [1] \\
 \Rightarrow & aABC & [2] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBC & [3] \\
 \Rightarrow & aAbBcC & [4] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabBcC & [5] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabbcC & [6] \\
 \Rightarrow & aabbcc & [7]
 \end{aligned}$$

Example: PG

$PG\ G:$

- 1: $S \rightarrow ABC, \{2, 5\}$
- 2: $A \rightarrow aA, \{3\}$
- 3: $B \rightarrow bB, \{4\}$
- 4: $C \rightarrow cC, \{2, 5\}$
- 5: $A \rightarrow a, \{6\}$
- 6: $B \rightarrow b, \{7\}$
- 7: $C \rightarrow c, \emptyset$

G generates $aabbcc$:

- S
- $\Rightarrow ABC [1]$
- $\Rightarrow aABC [2]$
- $\Rightarrow aAbBC [3]$
- $\Rightarrow aAbBcC [4]$
- $\Rightarrow aabBcC [5]$
- $\Rightarrow aabbcC [6]$
- $\Rightarrow aabbcc [7]$

$$L(G) = \{a^n b^n c^n : n \geq 1\} \in P_3$$

Proof: $P_k = \#RS_k, k \geq 1$

$P_k \subseteq \#RS_k$:

Let G be a PG of index k . Construct a $\#RS H$ of index k , so H simulates derivation step

$a\underline{A}bBc \Rightarrow_G a\textcolor{magenta}{dXY}bBc [p: A \rightarrow dXY, \{q, o\}] \Rightarrow_G \dots [\textcolor{orange}{q}]$

as

$(\langle \underline{AB}, p \rangle, a\#b\#c) \Rightarrow_H (\langle XYB, q \rangle, a\textcolor{magenta}{d}\#\#b\#c)$
 $[\langle \underline{AB}, p \rangle \ 1^\# \rightarrow \langle XYB, q \rangle \ d\#\#]$

Proof: $\#RS_k = P_k$, $k \geq 1$

$$\#RS_k \subseteq P_k$$

Let H be a $\#RS$ of index k . Construct a PG G of index k , so G simulates a computational step

$$(\mathbf{p}, a\underline{\#}b\underline{\#}c) \Rightarrow_H (\mathbf{q}, a\underline{a}\underline{\#}b\underline{b}\underline{\#}c) [\mathbf{p}_1 \rightarrow q \ a\underline{\#}b]$$

as

$$a\underline{\langle p, 1, 2 \rangle} b \langle p, 2, 2 \rangle c$$

1) Renumbering: $\Rightarrow_G a \langle q'', 1, 2 \rangle b \underline{\langle p, 2, 2 \rangle} c$

$$\Rightarrow_G a \underline{\langle q'', 1, 2 \rangle} b \langle q', 2, 2 \rangle c$$

2) Rewriting: $\Rightarrow_G a \underline{a} \underline{\langle q', 1, 2 \rangle} b b \langle q', 2, 2 \rangle c$

3) Finalization: $\Rightarrow_G a a \langle q, 1, 2 \rangle b b \underline{\langle q', 2, 2 \rangle} c$

$$\Rightarrow_G a a \langle q, 1, 2 \rangle b b \langle q, 2, 2 \rangle c$$

Proof: $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$, $k \geq 1$

Recall that:

- $P_k \subset P_{k+1}$, for all $k \geq 1$
-

As $P_k = \#RS_k$, for all $k \geq 1$, we have

Theorem: $\#RS_k \subset \#RS_{k+1}$, for all $k \geq 1$.

Future Investigation

- Determinism
- Unlimited index
- Other variants:
 - Right-linear
 - Context-sensitive
 - Parallel

Discussion